

1 VILLAGE OF GREENPORT

2 COUNTY OF SUFFOLK: STATE OF NEW YORK

3 -----X

4 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

5 REGULAR MEETING

6 -----X

7 Third Street Firehouse

8 Greenport, New York 11944

9 January 08, 2026

10 5:00 p.m.

11

12

13 **BEFORE :**

14 JANICE CLAUDIO - CHAIRPERSON (absent)

15 ROSELLE BORRELLI - MEMBER

16 FRANCES WALTON - MEMBER

17 DENNIS MCMAHON - MEMBER

18 LISA GILLOOLY - MEMBER (absent)

19

20 MICHAEL NOONE - CLERK TO THE BOARD

21 ROBERT HARPER - HISTORICAL ADVISOR

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. WALTON: Okay. I would like to call to order this meeting of the Village of Greenport Historic Preservation Commission. This is -- the time is 5:00 p.m. on January 8th, 2026. I am Frances Walton and I am filling in for our chair in her absence.

We have a relatively short agenda today made shorter by the removal of the item related to the discussion of the commission draft guidelines on murals in public art. I have removed the item from today's agenda because it came to my attention that the Mural Committee, appointed by the Village Trustees has not yet had a chance to meet as a whole and discuss the draft that had been sent to them by our Chair. In light of that fact we do not yet have the input from the full committee and I believe further discussion of the matter by this commission is best left to a future

1 meeting after we've received feedback  
2 from the full committee and have had a  
3 chance to review the draft from them.  
4 I also think that it's important to  
5 hear comments from other members of  
6 the public who may have interest in  
7 the matter, but that is not on the  
8 agenda today.

9 Getting to the formal part of the  
10 agenda. The first order of business  
11 is to accept and approve the minutes  
12 from December 18, 2025, regular  
13 meeting of the commission. Does  
14 anyone have any comments or questions?

15 Hearing none, I'd like to make a  
16 motion to accept those minutes.

17 MS. BORRELLI: Second.

18 MS. WALTON: Thank you. All in  
19 favor?

20 THE BOARD: Aye.

21 MS. WALTON: The second order of  
22 business this evening is a motion to  
23 schedule the next Historic  
24 Preservation Commission Meeting for  
25 5:00 p.m. on February 12, 2026, at the

1 Station One Fire House. Located at  
2 3rd and South Streets in Greenport. I  
3 move a motion to schedule our next  
4 meeting accordingly. Do I have a  
5 second?

6 MS. BORRELLI: I'll second.

7 MR. MCMAHON: I will not be able  
8 to make that.

9 MS. WALTON: Okay. So noted.

10 MR. MCMAHON: I'll be on the  
11 operating table.

12 MS. WALTON: Oh, I'm sorry to hear  
13 that. We will check for a quorum in  
14 that event.

15 Do I have a second all in favor?

16 MS. BORRELLI: I second.

17 MS. WALTON: All in favor?

18 THE BOARD: Aye.

19 MS. WALTON: The third order of  
20 business is to consider the  
21 application of Jose Salguero on behalf  
22 of Rhinow Gregory. The applicant  
23 proposes to replace 50% of the  
24 existing roof in kind with Grand Manor  
25 Roofing Shingles by Certainteed. It's

1 Suffolk County Tax Map number  
2 1001-2-1-24.

3 Is there a representative here  
4 this evening for the applicant, if so  
5 would you come to the podium please  
6 and state your name and address?

7 MR. SALGUERO: Good afternoon  
8 everyone. I am the roofer for Mr.  
9 Greg and he's proposing --

10 MR. NOONE: You have to say your  
11 name and address.

12 MR. SALGUERO: Oh okay. Jose  
13 Salguero and 823 Main Street, in  
14 Greenport. We have a proposal to  
15 replace 50% of the roof and this is  
16 the sample that I have that we're  
17 gonna use.

18 MS. WALTON: Can you bring it up  
19 to us please. Robert do you want to  
20 see it up close or are you good?

21 MR. HARPER: No, but I do have  
22 some comments about the type.

23 MS. WALTON: Do you have any other  
24 comments that you would like to make  
25 with regard to the work the is being

1 done?

2 MR. SALGUERO: No.

3 MS. WALTON: No. One question  
4 that I did have to start with is that  
5 the application says 50% of the roof.  
6 It didn't specify what portion of the  
7 roof.

8 MR. SALGUERO: It's the main part  
9 of the house because the back side was  
10 already done. They did it in the past  
11 so we're doing the front part of the  
12 house, and the house it has like a  
13 flat roof on the top and we're not  
14 doing the flat roof because it's a low  
15 area.

16 MS. WALTON: So the front slope  
17 and the side?

18 MR. SALGUERO: Well the house has  
19 four sides. The main house, the main  
20 part so were going to replace the four  
21 sides but on the top they have like a  
22 flat roof so we not doing that on the  
23 flat roof.

24 MS. WALTON: Understood.

25 MR. SALGUERO: The back portion is

1           already done, like they did in the  
2           past.

3           MS. WALTON:   With the same  
4           shingles?

5           MR. SALGUERO:   Yes.

6           MS. WALTON:   Do -- I don't know  
7           whether to turn it over to Robert  
8           first, but Dennis do you have any  
9           questions?

10          MR. MCMAHON:   No, I don't have any  
11          questions.

12          MS. BORRELLI:  I have a question,  
13          Jose.  So the roof that they put in  
14          the back, did they put that asphalt  
15          type shingle on there?

16          MR. SALGUERO:  Well it's a  
17          different manufacturer.

18          MS. BORRELLI:  Okay.

19          MS. WALTON:   But it's similar?

20          MR. SALGUERO:  It's similar, yeah  
21          it's asphalt shingle and it's the  
22          shingle when they put it but from the  
23          street you can't really see it in the  
24          back.

25          MS. BORRELLI:  And you're taking

1 off the front -- you're taking off all  
2 the slate?

3 MR. SALGUERO: Yes, we've got to  
4 remove everything and go back to the  
5 wood.

6 MS. BORRELLI: Your going to the  
7 wood, you're taking off the slate and  
8 you're going to put the asphalt  
9 shingles?

10 MR. SALGUERO: Correct, but they  
11 already have part of -- they have --  
12 the left side of the house they  
13 already did and that's part of the  
14 past. So half of the main house has  
15 asphalt shingles and the other half  
16 has the slate roof.

17 MS. BORRELLI: Okay. So my next  
18 question, without getting into  
19 personal details, I don't want to know  
20 everything but I want to know  
21 something. In your opinion how much  
22 more expensive, like if it cost \$100  
23 to do asphalt on that roof, how much  
24 would it cost to do it in slate -- to  
25 replace the slate as is?

1           MR. SALGUERO: It would be like  
2 triple for slate like that.

3           MS. BORRELLI: So that's a 100 and  
4 it's 300 to do it in slate?

5           MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, correct.

6           MS. BORRELLI: There's no cheaper  
7 slate than three times what it would  
8 cost?

9           MR. SALGUERO: No, they do the  
10 imitation slate now, the composite  
11 material but it's still expensive.

12          MS. BORRELLI: Isn't that like  
13 supposed to be imitating slate?

14          MR. SALGUERO: Well, very close  
15 but it's not imitation slate.

16          MS. BORRELLI: It's not?

17          MR. SALGUERO: No. He's got leak  
18 all over the place and that's why he  
19 don't want to go over expensive.

20          MS. BORRELLI: So three times  
21 more?

22          MR. SALGUERO: Yes. At least.

23          MS. WALTON: So I guess I'm a  
24 little unclear as to why the work  
25 would be described as "Replacement in

1 kind," if it's not being replaced with  
2 the same material. Can you explain  
3 why it's been described as, in kind?

4 MR. MCMAHON: I think that --  
5 unless I'm wrong I think, in kind,  
6 meant the back roof section. That's  
7 what my thought was.

8 MS. WALTON: That might have been  
9 the case but that is misleading  
10 because it sounds like the slate roof  
11 that's existing that your planning to  
12 replace is being replaced in kind.

13 MR. SALGUERO: Well, yes. They --  
14 I don't know if they did it over but  
15 they, yes many years ago they put an  
16 asphalt roof because the house -- the  
17 main house was lower so they had the  
18 rear part of the house is longer.  
19 That part of the house was done not to  
20 long ago. The main part of the house  
21 he did it like, he said 20 years ago,  
22 he did it in asphalt. He did like LT  
23 and he left all the slate on the other  
24 part of the house. So now he's doing  
25 the all the other side using the same

1 materials.

2 MS. WALTON: Yeah, not what I  
3 would understand to be in kind.

4 MR. MCMAHON: Is any portion of  
5 the main house done in that?

6 MR. SALGUERO: No, not on the  
7 front.

8 MR. MCMAHON: Just the back  
9 section?

10 MR. SALGUERO: Right.

11 MS. WALTON: It is a shame to lose  
12 that historic material. I'm  
13 sympathetic to the cost but it is an  
14 historic structure and it's really a  
15 shame to lose that material. Was  
16 there any discussion with the owner  
17 about replacing it with slate?

18 MR. SALGUERO: Well I give him a  
19 price to do the slate but it's a lot  
20 more money, and they look like they  
21 don't have that much money to do  
22 because that house left by his father  
23 and own it by him and his sister, but  
24 they don't have that much money to do  
25 and they have leaks all over. And he

1           want me to do something temporary but  
2           I say it's not much I can do, there's  
3           leaks all over the place and if I go  
4           to the attic I can see light through.

5           MS. WALTON:   That's scary.

6           MS. BORRELLI:  Well maybe, we  
7           could -- mention to Greg if he would  
8           have possibly applied for some kind of  
9           the grants that we have for historic  
10          homes that he would possibly allay  
11          some of the costs by getting a grant  
12          to do -- not a grant but a tax credit  
13          to do that.  If that might help him to  
14          replace the slate.  And my second  
15          question if we could relay that to  
16          Greg and let him know that.  Maybe we  
17          could reach out to him as the HPC or  
18          something, or a phone call and try to  
19          offer to help him maybe or at least if  
20          he knew that these types of credits  
21          exist that it might help him think it.  
22          And the second question is, is there  
23          anything -- wait let me just write  
24          down my third question, it's gone  
25          already.  But my second question would

1           be is there anything between this tile  
2           and the slate that looks a little bit  
3           more like slate than that?

4           MR. SALGUERO: No, this is the one  
5           -- this is the most expensive asphalt  
6           shingle that you can get. This is the  
7           one version that most of the people  
8           use that's why we went with this  
9           because this is the one that is close  
10          to what he already has right now.  
11          There's not anything in between unless  
12          you go with the real.

13          MS. BORRELLI: Now I remember the  
14          third question. When you remove that  
15          slate what are you going to do with  
16          it? And I ask only because should  
17          Greg sell in the future, if he kept  
18          the slate somewhere maybe a future  
19          owner or something would replace and  
20          put the slate back. Is the slate  
21          useable?

22          MR. SALGUERO: No. It's falling  
23          apart. You can't really save it it's  
24          falling apart.

25          MS. BORRELLI: Yeah, okay. That'

1 all my questions.

2 MS. WALTON: Robert.

3 MR. HARPER: Yeah, sorry. This is  
4 one of my favorite types of houses.  
5 It's what's called a French Mansard  
6 Roof. The Mansard roof goes back to  
7 France in the 17 century. There was a  
8 guy that's named Francois Mansart,  
9 with a "T", and it kind of fell out of  
10 favor, and then during the reign of  
11 Napoleon the 3rd, which is sometime  
12 referred to as the second empire.  
13 That was about 1852 to 1870 it became  
14 popular in France. And anyone that's  
15 been to Paris, when you go down those  
16 main boulevards, you will see those  
17 all over the place. It became popular  
18 in the United States somewhere around  
19 1860 to 1890. They're almost, I'm  
20 gonna say, pretty much always done in  
21 slate. There's several examples in  
22 the Village here and the most notable  
23 is the one that's diagonally across  
24 from the auditorium. They also would  
25 incorporate into the slate different

1 colors. So the one that's across from  
2 the auditorium has almost like a  
3 flower like design in it across and  
4 it's extremely well done.

5 I came across five of them in the  
6 historic district. One of them has a  
7 roofing shingle that I had to get up  
8 close to see that it wasn't slate. It  
9 is an asphalt shingle. It's an  
10 architectural shingle and it's  
11 different from those. They're  
12 narrower and then have more of the  
13 corners cut off which makes it look  
14 like slate. I did take a photograph  
15 of it and if you would like to pass  
16 this around, and Jose you're welcome  
17 to take a look at it also.

18 MS. BORRELLI: That's Hamilton's  
19 house.

20 MR. HARPER: Okay.

21 MS. BORRELLI: My house has got  
22 the Mansard roof too and it's got  
23 color patterns. I got green and  
24 eggplant.

25 MR. MCMAHON: I painstakingly

1           stripped the slate roof off and  
2           scrubbed the tar off of them. That  
3           looks pretty nice.

4           MS. BORRELLI: And you did an  
5           amazing job on it.

6           MR. MCMAHON: Do you know who the  
7           manufacturer is?

8           MR. HARPER: I'm not sure. It  
9           could be GAS.

10          MR. SALGUERO: Do you know the  
11          name?

12          MR. HARPER: I just know the  
13          address of the house. This has been  
14          photographed just about an hour ago.

15          MS. BORRELLI: That's Hamilton's.  
16          It's got the anchor out in the front,  
17          right, the big anchor in front of the  
18          house.

19          MR. HARPER: If you scroll you  
20          might see a picture of the whole front  
21          of the house. I took a close up. I  
22          literally had to cross the street to  
23          see that it wasn't slate.

24          MR. MCMAHON: You don't think  
25          that's a Hardy Plank product?

1           MR. HARPER: Take a close look at  
2           it Dennis, you're better than I am.

3           MR. MCMAHON: I'm struggling. I  
4           can't make it out it could be one  
5           thing or the other, but it has a heavy  
6           shadow line on it.

7           MR. HARPER: Yeah, it does. And  
8           the fact that it's narrower and the  
9           corner's are clipped I think gives it  
10          the illusion that it's slate.

11          MS. BORRELLI: And right now I  
12          think it's all one color, right Jose.

13          MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, because they  
14          painted it.

15          MS. BORRELLI: They painted the  
16          slate?

17          MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, they painted  
18          the slate. That's why it looks like  
19          that.

20          MS. BORRELLI: They gave it a  
21          silver color.

22          MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, he patch it  
23          and paint it to stop leak but it  
24          doesn't hold anything anymore.

25          MR. MCMAHON: Theses days you put

1 a full water barrier underneath it?

2 MR. SALGUERO: Yes.

3 MR. MCMAHON: Back then they did  
4 not. You might have some tar paper or  
5 something and it only holds up for  
6 some time.

7 MR. SALGUERO: There another  
8 project also that maybe you can look  
9 on like it's called Camelot by GAF.

10 MR. HARPER: I'm almost positive  
11 it's a GAF product and I believe  
12 Riverhead Building Supply carries  
13 this. I think it would be no more  
14 expensive than what you're proposing.  
15 And I think -- did you take a look at  
16 this Jose?

17 MR. SALGUERO: Yes, I did. What  
18 about -- let me show you. This is  
19 another project but it's not close to  
20 that one. It's called I think Camelot  
21 shingles.

22 MS. BORRELLI: Yeah, did you see  
23 that Dennis? That doesn't -- I don't  
24 know.

25 MS. WALTON: Do you think the

1 applicant would be willing to take a  
2 look at this alternative?

3 MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, he might. He  
4 is a little tough guy, he don't want  
5 to -- I told him to come and, you know  
6 --

7 MS. WALTON: He didn't want to be  
8 here. That's unfortunate.

9 MR. SALGUERO: What I can do is,  
10 if you can give me the address where  
11 you saw that and I can stop by. And  
12 if I can get that material would it be  
13 okay to?

14 MR. MCMAHON: That would lovely.  
15 I don't know if Riverhead Building  
16 doesn't have as many samples as they  
17 used to.

18 MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, they only  
19 have what they have. This is a  
20 material that is not that popular you  
21 don't see that.

22 MR. MCMAHON: Well it may be back  
23 in the hallway, going back towards the  
24 salesman's offices. I think that's a  
25 Hardy Plank, Hardy product, which are

1 not cheap.

2 MS. BORRELLI: I believe it's Main  
3 Street the one with the anchor.

4 You're on Main Street, no?

5 MR. SALGUERO: Yeah.

6 MS. BORRELLI: It's like, it's  
7 like before Hamilton so it's between  
8 Center and the next one up, which is  
9 Nords. In between there.

10 MS. WALTON: On Main Street.

11 MS. BORRELLI: On Main Street.  
12 327? 527.

13 MR. HARPER: It would be on the  
14 left side as you're North.

15 MS. BORRELLI: Yes, yes.

16 MS. WALTON: Robert do you have  
17 any other thoughts or comments at this  
18 time?

19 MR. HARPER: Other than that I'm  
20 very excited about a Mansard roof. I  
21 think it's a wonderful style and this  
22 is a very fine example of it.

23 MS. WALTON: Little unsure of how  
24 to proceed. In the light of the fact  
25 that there are leaks in the roof, and

1           seemingly some urgency to moving  
2           forward I don't particularly want to  
3           delay this for another month until  
4           you've had a chance to review the  
5           matter, can we approve it with the  
6           understanding that the applicant will  
7           consider the proposal alternative.  
8           Does that work, Mike?

9           MR. NOONE:   That works, that works  
10          very well.

11          MR. MCMAHON:  Let me ask you a  
12          question.  Are you -- you're gonna  
13          strip the roof are you gonna put the  
14          weather guard?

15          MR. SALGUERO:  Yes, we're gonna do  
16          the weather guard.  Yeah.

17          MR. MCMAHON:  That will buy you a  
18          little time perhaps.  Well you could  
19          -- the blue skin?  You know what I'm  
20          talking about the self sticking, the  
21          blue skin.  If you want to prep the  
22          whole roof it might buy you a little  
23          time.

24          MR. SALGUERO:  The thing is he has  
25          a little flat area that I have to use

1           that flat area and bring it up to the  
2           sloped roof, and then I have to do  
3           that. The thing is with this weather  
4           we can't really wait. And he got in  
5           the attic, I mean, anybody can go  
6           there and see but he's got plastic all  
7           over. He has to sweep the water  
8           because the water is just sitting in  
9           those areas. The house is beautiful  
10          but they let it go for so long.

11                 MS. WALTON: It's a shame. Okay.  
12           And so everybody is good with that?

13                 MR. NOONE: So there's no actually  
14           specific recommendation? It's someone  
15           is gonna go to the house in question  
16           and find out what that alternative is?

17                 MS. WALTON: I think Jose is.

18                 MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, I'm gonna  
19           stop by and take a look and see.

20                 MR. NOONE: So it's more  
21           predicated on the applicant to  
22           consider recommended alternatives.

23                 MS. WALTON: Right. So I would  
24           make a motion to approve -- you know  
25           move forward, approve the application

1 before us with the understanding that  
2 Jose will investigate --

3 MR. SALGUERO: Yeah, if the money  
4 is close I know he will do it. If  
5 it's a lot more money he might. The  
6 problem is with the money.

7 MS. WALTON: So investigate  
8 proposed alternative roofing material.  
9 So I have a motion, do I have a  
10 second.

11 MR. MCMAHON: I'll second it.

12 MS. BORRELLI: I'll second it,  
13 yeah.

14 MS. WALTON: All in favor?

15 THE BOARD: Aye.

16 MS. WALTON: Thank you. And  
17 finally is there any other business  
18 that the commission members would like  
19 to discuss at this time?

20 MR. MCMAHON: Nope. Nothing.

21 MS. BORRELLI: No.

22 MS. WALTON: With that said I  
23 would like to make a motion to  
24 adjourn. Do I have a second?

25 MS. BORRELLI: I'll second.

1 MS. WALTON: All in favor?

2 THE BOARD: Aye.

3 MS. WALTON: Okay. Thank you.

4 (Meeting was closed.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E .

STATE OF NEW YORK )

:ss

COUNTY OF SUFFOLK )

I, GLORIA ROSANTE, a Notary Public  
in and for the State of New York, do  
hereby certify:

That this transcript is a true  
record of the testimony given.

I further certify that I am not  
related to any of the parties by blood  
or marriage; and that I am in no way  
interested in the outcome of this  
matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have  
hereunto set my hand in FEBRUARY OF  
2026.

---

GLORIA ROSANTE